

Κέρκυρα, 27-29 Απριλίου 2012

Corfu, 27-29 April 2012

ΣΥΝΕΔΡΙΟ
ΦΙΛΟΣΟΦΙΑΣ ΚΑΙ ΜΟΥΣΙΚΗΣ
«Θεωρίες του Χρόνου και Μουσική»

PHILOSOPHY
AND MUSIC CONFERENCE
«Time Theories and Music»



Time Theories and Music Conference

Ionian University / Corfu, 27-29 April 2012

Proceedings

ed. by Panos Vlagopoulos

Ionian University - Department of Music Studies

Corfu, 2013

Magdalini TSEVRENI*

Philosophy of Time and Music through the study and presentation of Handel's oratorio *The Triumph of Time and Truth*

Introduction

Time, a dark, dominant and ruthless figure, which in his decisive and impartial ways exempts no person from his painful task, is conversing with Beauty. Time is the antagonist of Pleasure and an ally of Disillusionment. This is how Time appears in Handel's libretto, written by cardinal Benedetto Pamphili and presented for the first time to the Italian public in 1707 with Handel's oratorio, *Il Trionfo del Tempo et del Disinganno*¹. This is one of Handel's first works and it came before the composer's major works. It also accompanied him through his entire life.

The oratorio's central theme remains unchanged in the three transcriptions of the work. It begins with Beauty taking an oath of fidelity to Pleasure in return for the promise of eternal beauty. Beauty gradually comes to understand the ethical value of virtue, at the behest of Time and Disillusionment. Their aim is to persuade her of a profound truth: that external beauty is ephemeral and that the only thing of value is internal beauty of the spirit and of the soul. In the end, Beauty abandons the agreement with Pleasure in order to follow Truth on the path of virtue and religion.

The oratorio's obvious argument is based on the dualism of soul and body. It underscores the corresponding distinction between the concepts of the beautiful, in other words the distinction between the aesthetically and the spiritually beautiful. The beautiful appears both as a presupposition of sensory pleasure and as a virtue within Christian logos. As a virtue, the Beauty converts in to the Good, and it describes a quality of the soul; it is only in this capacity that one is able to contemplate divine harmony and commitment to the eternal and the infinite.

In this paper, however, we will not focus on the libretto's master argument but rather on a secondary element of the story that has gone unnoticed. This is the intricate subject of time. We will present a succession of musical pieces with the aim of isolating a number of elements connected to the concept of time². In so doing, we will attempt to develop the corresponding philosophical issues and, in what follows, the possible connections

between philosophy of time, theory of music and aesthetics. The overall aim in this paper is to provide an outline of the interconnected discourse around time and music, their profound ties within the philosophical tradition.

Section 1

A

The introductory remark by Time in the allegorical dialogue –following the pledge of Pleasure to protect Beauty on condition that the latter remains faithful– is that he can easily show that ‘...Beauty is but a flower... that in a single day is charming and lovely, and then dies’. ‘If Beauty/ loses its bloom,/ if it fades or dies,/ it never returns./ For only one moment/ the pretty flower/ of youth/ laughs in happiness’³.

B

These lines gesture towards the issue of decay. The changes all around us are continuous, the alterations on objects and on our bodies are so familiar that we no longer notice them: an apple left alone will eventually rot (decay), every spring the trees will bloom (alteration). These continuous changes in the properties of things fail to catch our attention as incremental decays. Instead, we tend to perceive them as distinct stages: one day we might observe that the trees are in bloom or that the apple has gone bad. It is thus that we observe the passage of time⁴.

Changes in bodies appear to occur with the passage of time. It seems that the passage, the movement of time, changes bodies, it appears to put them in some sort of motion. So, time becomes motion and a measure of motion: it puts bodies and objects into motion, it alters them and changes them.

But does time move? The notion of time as movement is merely a metaphor. It is otherwise difficult to describe this internal sense of time without the aid of metaphors. This is why we speak of the flow and the passage of time. The metaphors we use for time endow it automatically with a spatial dimension, which it does not in fact possess. The unbound and careless use of metaphors may lead to serious philosophical problems⁵.

C

The concept of decay is not connected to music. However, the issues of movement, of the metaphorical use of language and the necessity of using mostly spatial metaphors and

expressions for music, present us with an interesting philosophical convergence of the theories about time and music. Metaphors, analogies and examples are one of the ways we refer to a musical piece to describe the music itself or the experience of listening to it⁶. The metaphorical use of motion is particularly prominent in the description of the musical theme. As we listen to the musical theme unfolding, it seems as if it is moving, as if it is following a pattern of incremental development. The flow of the music, the feeling that the music is advancing or moving within time is one of the profound dimensions of musical experience⁷.

Here we come to two fundamental issues of the theory of music. The first regards a musical oeuvre as text, to the extent that the succession of notes makes up musical sentences, which, in turn, are the building blocks of the work itself. Yet this approach primarily connects music to language and only in the second instance with time, which in this case represents the succession of notes that are necessary for meaning. The second issue that arises with respect to movement is the rhythm, or tempo, which situates music within time.

Section 2

A

When Beauty provokes Time and Pleasure into a duel against each other, Time declares, in a combative tone, that since even Gods have collapsed in his wake, he has nothing to fear in Beauty⁸. In the aria that follows, we are reminded of mortality and the finitude of existence: ‘Your funeral urns that enclose/ so many beauties,/ be opened,/ show me/ if any of their light/ remains in you./ Rather be closed:/ specters of grief/ and ghastly skeletons/ are what my teeth have left behind’⁹. Further on, Disillusionment emphasizes that ‘One glance is enough/ to survey the span of mortal life’¹⁰. Time is identified with death and so it is to be expected that we find Pleasure declaring ‘Time has always been unpleasing to man’¹¹.

B

Between life and death lies the experienced, empirical time of existence. In our primary experience, we perceive time as tyrannical and unpleasant, like it is the one that sets us upon a predetermined path towards death. Yet, a closer look at the relationship between

the subject and time reveals that the subject partakes in time, subsists only within time, giving rise to the concept of experienced duration that is highly relative for the subject¹².

The concepts of beginning and end, of instant and duration surface through the reminder that existence is finite. But what is the relationship between instantaneity and duration? Does time have a duration that consists of a succession or sequence of independent and indivisible instants? If, on the contrary, time is characterized by a continuous, indivisible, infinite duration -which simultaneously creates and prevents repetition- then it is impossible to comprehend its infinitude, or to specify its very nature.

C

On the basis of the feeling of temporal succession, we find here, on the one hand, a clear correlation between experienced, empirical time and the subjective nature of how duration is experienced; and, on the other, the experience of attending to a musical piece. The notion that music unfolds within temporal succession, as much as through it, is one of the dominant views on music, particularly in the 16th and 17th centuries¹³.

Subjective time possesses its own tempo: the more vacant it is, the more it weighs upon us; the more joyful it is, the more intense it seems. The composer is aware of this and is able to handle the variations and the internal hues of the music. This becomes clear in Handel oratorio: In the da capo arias he plays as much with bucolic scenes, with elation and the pleasures as he does with the harsh tone of Time, and with religious and otherworldly nuances.

The theme of instantaneity and duration brings to the foreground another well-known issue in the philosophy of music: the issue of tone and melody. In reference to time, the philosopher Edmund Husserl famously said that to become aware of a melody we need to hear the melody in its entirety, and not each note of the melody separately. The same is true of time: we do not need to be consciously aware of each instant passing in order to be aware of duration. To become aware of a melody and to become aware of time, we need to be conscious of succession and progression which are necessary ingredients of both concepts¹⁴.

Section 3

A

Returning now to the oratorio, it does not seem strange that Beauty states boldly that ‘With cunning self-deceit, when one is not thinking of Time, then one enjoys oneself’¹⁵. Yet Time, even when we are not aware of him, when we are not thinking of him or not paying attention to him, proceeds with his work, continues to be there without exception¹⁶. Here, a new dimension of Time makes its appearance as Time says to Beauty ‘When man is born, he is born as a baby,/ the year is born already old./ Man is always about to pass away,/ the year arises out of time past’¹⁷. To this, Disillusionment adds ‘Man is always destroying himself,/ the year is always renewing itself./ The year departs, but returns even as it flees,/ man departs, but is never found again’¹⁸.

B

At this point, then, we find the distinction but also the antithesis between time in itself and human time. Time in itself is not matter, but a constitutive element of matter, and it is not perceivable by any of the senses. Time in itself is the time of science and can only be rendered ‘visible’ through mathematics and physics because time has the strictness and the exactitude of scientific and natural laws.

Human time is not the subjective, experienced time, but the human time span dissociated from its subjective contribution. Time in itself is cyclical whereas human time is linear. Here we turn to a different perspective of the topology of time by emphasizing its two fundamental spatial representations: the line and the circle.

Cyclical time has no beginning or end, it constantly renews and reinvents itself in an infinite cyclical movement that gives forth repetition and explains the succession of temporal events. Human time follows a linear, progressive, dynamic path that modifies and alters the subject, which is a part of time while at the same time it finds itself on an incessant, irreversible path.

C

If we take this problematic as our starting point, there are various ways to connect time with theories of music. In reference to time itself and to human time, we can see two

distinct trends in music. In the first, music seeks its connection with the universe, its establishment as a constitutive element within the creation of the cosmos. In the second, music becomes a stage for the expression of mankind's emotions and passions. This distinction appears during the Baroque period, during which music was influenced by the emergence of Humanism¹⁹.

Earlier we discussed the difference between cyclical and linear time. In this case, we can suppose that if the linear nature of time brings us back to the issue of temporal succession and therefore to music as text, then cyclical time, that renews and reinvents itself, points in the direction of regarding music as a dynamic product of active art. In this context, music would be an activity, an energy that precedes the inscription of the musical piece²⁰. The combination of composition and interpretation in music becomes necessary to the production of meaning²¹.

Section 4

A

We now find Beauty on the threshold as she realizes that Time is always present within her, even if she consciously selects Pleasure. Then Time explains to her that 'Whatever this world encompasses is my realm./ If you do not want to see me,/ aspire to gain a precious seat in Heaven;/ in Heaven, where I have no place,/ and where glorious Eternity resides'²². Now, Time has raised the curtain to reveal the theater of Truth. Truth, seated and facing eternal light, plain and in her white robes, shines in her own majestic tranquility and beauty.

B

Our interest shifts from the subject, the experience, the universe and science towards the quest for truth. 'What is truth'²³ then and what is its relation to time?²⁴ Time reigns over the earth and everything in the earthly dominion belongs to him. The same however is not true of the Heavens, from which time, besides being absent, does not even venture near: the Heavens represent the kingdom of eternity.

Time and eternity represent a conceptual pair with a long history in philosophy and metaphysics. The starting point of this discussion is in Plato's *Timaeus*, where time is described as the moving image of eternity, and so time and eternity are both distinguished

and irrevocably connected. Eternity is motionless, unchangeable, immutable, it belongs to something intangible and perfect. Time, however, belongs to this world, in which the ephemeral, the mutable, unstable phenomena succeed one another and no thing is fixed and stable.

Truth, also motionless, and facing the eternal light of the Heavens, mediates between two realms: the earthly and the divine, the transient and the unchangeable. Truth, and to the same degree falsity, coexist in the mind and not in things. This is the reason why we can approach them in thought. Pleasure, in contrast to Truth, belongs to the body, concerns only the present and is ephemeral. The interplay between time and eternity therefore continues. Since time is in our world and as a representation of eternity, with the help of truth we can come closer to the divine.

C

Time is connected to eternity. Something analogous occurs in the case of music. Up until the Enlightenment, we find theories connecting music with the heavens, with the motion of the planets, and with harmony²⁵. From ancient Greece to the Renaissance, arithmetic, geometry, astronomy and harmony share strong bonds and affinities²⁶. Musical analogies become part of science. Since numbers seem to be behind every musical theory, astronomical explanation but also alongside time, music, astronomy and time have the same common denominator. The heavens seem to possess an internal, intrinsic similarity to the sounds and the musical intervals of the cosmos, since rhythm and rhythmical movement are common to both time and the heavens.

Section 5

A

Time offers Beauty the mirror of Truth and tells her that in it she will witness the three periods of life: 'Divide the hours of your life/ into three parts, and look at each one;/ look at Time past,/ look, heartless one, at your refusal/ of the eternal lights, and at your own error./ Look at Time present, dying even as it is born./ If from behind yonder heavy curtain/ where Time future lies/ your gaze can discern nothing,/ the way is open to hope and deeds'²⁷.

B

Past, present and future, before, now and after, was, is and will be: the three temporal dimensions of existence²⁸. The past we can only reconstruct, though this is no guarantee of the truth of its existence. The present will always elude us because as soon as we become aware of it, the next moment comes along and commits it to the past. And, we can only hypothesize about the future. Similarly, since music unfolds in time, we can say that it acquires its true or full existence when it passes by. The temporal dimensions refer to what I have called linear time, the time of humans and History. After all, in cyclical time there is no succession but rather sequence/continuity. On the other hand, human time and historical time seem to follow the arrow of time.

C

Il Trionfo del Tempo et del Disinganno is Handel's first oratorio and was presented in the spring of 1707. While in England, thirty years later, Handel developed a condition that paralyzed his right hand and prevented him from playing music²⁹. Shortly afterwards, in the spring of 1737 he presented again a transcription of that oratorio maintaining the Italian language. Handel's health started to deteriorate in the beginning of the 1750's, and despite his doctors' best efforts, he began losing his eyesight. This time the libretto was translated in English by Thomas Morel and presented in the spring of 1757. Shortly after this musical period, in 1759, Handel died. There is an obvious and tempting biographical symmetry in the fact that Handel began and ended his musical career with the same oratorio³⁰.

Handel was deeply religious and remained a devout Lutheran despite the fact that he spent most of his life in London among Anglicans and Catholics. Perhaps the repeated appearances of the oratorio reveal Handel's deep religious feelings, making the oratorio itself a sort of personal prayer.

In the end,

Beauty finally realizes that the soul is more beautiful than the mortal body and true pleasure surpasses earthly delights. She repents, gives herself up to Truth and renounces Pleasure and her ephemeral joys. After all, the soul that is filled with faith is indifferent to all that.

Pleasure remains committed to the present and can only provide spurious comfort to her victims whom she deceives with false promises. As she says ‘I create satisfaction for the here and the now. I do not offer the image of joy that is regarded as the Ideal of Heroes’³¹.

The ideal world of heroes exists so that it may remind us, according to Meister Eckhart, that the ideal existence of things is truer than corporeal existence in space and time³².

We have seen in the five sections of the present study some of the fundamental issues in the Philosophy of Time and we have connected these with some of the issues in the theory of music. We passed from philosophy and metaphysics to historical time. We examined the concept of motion, the dialectic between instant and duration, between subjective and objective time, between cyclical and linear representations of time, its relation to the sciences and the dimensions of linear time. Regarding the corresponding issues in the theory of music, we began with musical experience, music as text and as activity, moving on to the characteristics and the properties of time and music and its relationship with the sciences, and we also presented a few elements of history of music.

The concept of time is notoriously complex. Since it is the presupposition of existence, of knowledge, of the individual and of reason, we usually make it fit the needs of our analysis. Yet we must not forget that it is time that underpins the discussion on the relation between time and music, and not vice versa. Music unfolds by following a temporal succession, it unfolds within time. The relationship between music and time is not bidirectional, but has only one, irreversible direction: from time to music.

¹*PhD Candidate, National and Kapodistrian University of Athens Faculty of Political Science and Public Administration

This is the title of the oratorio as first appeared. Disinganno is best translated as Disillusionment. The second transcription, in 1737, has the title *Il Tionfo del Tempo et della Verita* (The Triumph of Time and Truth) and that is the title preferred by Thomas Morell, on the third transcription and the first translation of the oratorio in English, in 1757. The oratorio is most known today with the same title, *The Triumph of Time and Truth*.

² For the presentation I use the text of the oratorio as first appeared and for the translation of the verses in English I follow the booklet from the CD of Early Opera Company, Wingmore Hall, where the libretto is translated by the musicologist and Handel scholar, Antony Hicks.

³ «...la Bellezza e un fiore... che in un sol giorno e vago e bello, e muore» and Aria: Disinganno: «Se la bellezza/ perde vaghezza,/ se cado o more/ non torna piu./ E un sol momento/ ride contento/ il vago fiore/ de gioventu ».

⁴ Αριστοτέλης (Aristotle), *Περί γενέσεως και φθοράς* (On Coming-to-Be and Passing Away; On Generation and Corruption), Βασίλης Κάλφας (ed.), Νήσος, Athens 2011. Αριστοτέλης (Aristotle), *Φυσικά* (Physics), Βιβλίο Δ (Book IV), Η.Π. Νικολούδης (ed.), Κάκτος, Athens 1997. For an interpretation of Aristotelian theory and Time see Remi Brague, «Dans ou avec le temps?» in *Du temps chez Platon et Aristote; Quatre études*, édition Quadrige/PUF, Paris 1982. For the relation of change and time see, among others, T.H. Mellor, «The Unreality of Tense», στο Robin Le Poidevin και Murray Macbeath (ed.), *The Philosophy of Time*, Oxford University Press, Oxford 1993, p. 47-59 and Richard M. Gale (ed.), *The Philosophy of Time; a collection of essays*, Prometheus Books, 1968.

⁵ Such problems occur when philosophy doesn't succeed in understanding the boundaries of the metaphorical use of language. This is a prominent issue in the analytical philosophy. For the problems that may occur by the literal understanding of language in the specific matter of Time, see Tim Maudlin, «Remarks on the Passing of Time», in *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* New Series, No. 102, (2002), p. 259-274. For the metaphorical use of language in the aspect of Time see, for example, two different approaches, in Norbert Elias, *Περί χρόνου* (*An Essay on Time*), trsl. Θ. Λουπασάκης, editions Εικοστού Πρώτου, Athens 2004, p. 59 κ.ε. and Paul Ricoeur, *Temps et Recit*, I και II, édition du Seuil, Paris 1983 and 1984 respectively. For the debate for the metaphorical use of language in Time see, for example, Arthur N. Prior, «Change in events and change in things», in Robin Le Poidevin και Murray Macbeath (ed.), *ibid.*, p. 35-46.

⁶ See, among others, Lewis Rowell, *Thinking about Music: an introduction to the Philosophy of Music*, University of Massachusetts Press, 1983. E.A. Lippman, *The Philosophy and Aesthetics of Music*, University of Nebraska Press, Lincoln and London 1999, p. 2-4 Kathleen Stock (ed.), *Philosophers on Music: Experience, Meaning, and Work*, Oxford University Press, Oxford 2007. Scruton, for example, in *The aesthetics of music*, Oxford University Press, 1999 suggests that musical qualities, such as harmony, melody, rhythm etc, are only metaphorically musical qualities. This has raised a big discussion. For the contestation of the use of metaphors, see, for example, Andrew Kania, *The Philosophy of Music*, Stanford encyclopedia of philosophy, § 4.

⁷ See, for example, Stephen Davies, *Musical Meaning and Expression*, Cornell University Press, Ithaca and London 1994, σελ. 232.

⁸ «I colossi del Sole/ per me caddero a terra:/ e una frate beltà meco fa Guerra?»

⁹ Aria: «Urne voi, che racchiudete/ tante belle,/ apritevi,/ mostratemi,/ se di quelle/ qualche luce in voi restò./ Ma chiudetevi:/ sono larve di dolore/ sono scheletri d'orrore/ ch'il mio dente abandonò»

¹⁰ «Della vita morale,/ scorre un guardo, il confine».

¹¹ Piacere: «il tempo sempre all' uomo e ingrato oggetto».

¹² For the existence of Time see J.M.E. McTaggart, «The Unreality of Time» in Robin Le Poidevin and Murray Macbeath (ed.), *ibid*, p. 23-34. See, for example, Etienne Klein, *Ο χρόνος* (*Le Temps*, Flammarion, Paris 1995), trsl. Μαργαρίτα Κουλεντιανού, Τραυλός, Athens 1997. For the correlation of existence and time see, for example, Alain Renaut (ed.), *Η φιλοσοφία* (*La Philosophie*, Odile Jacob, Paris 2006), trsl. Τάσος Μπέτζελοσ, ed. Άρης Στυλιανού, Πόλις editions, Athens 2009.

¹³ Carl Dahlhaus, *Αισθητική της μουσικής* (*Musikästhetik*), trsl. Απόστολος Οικονόμου, Στάχυ editions, Athens 2000, p. 31 κ.ε.

¹⁴ Βλ. Edmund Husserl, *On the Phenomenology of the Consciousness of Internal Time* (1893-1917), trns. J.B. Brough, Kluwer, Dordrecht 1991.

¹⁵ Bellezza: «Con ingegnosa frode,/ quando a lui non si pensa, allor si gode»

¹⁶ «Venga il Tempo, e con l'ali funeste/ tolga queste/ care gioie in si placide rive./ Egli dorme, e non ha piu gli artigli;/ no, non giovano tanti consigli/ se per vivere mai non si vive»

¹⁷ Tempo: «Nasce l'uomo ma nasce bambino,/ nasce l'anno, ma nasce canuto./ Uno e sempre al cader piu vicino,/ l'altro sorge dal tempo caduto»

¹⁸ Disinganno: «L'uomo sepmre se stesso distrugge,/ l'anno sempre se stesso rinouva./ uno parte ma torna se fugge,. L'altro parte ma piu non si trova»

¹⁹ Marie-Claire Beltrando-Patier, *Histoire de la musique occidentale du Moyen Age a nos jours*, Bordas, Paris 1982, p. 221 κ.ε. See, for example, A. Landgraf and D. Vickers (ed.), *The Cambridge Handel Encyclopedia*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge 2009, D. Burrows (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Handel*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge 1997, D. Burrows, *Handel*, Oxford University Press, Oxford 1994, E.A. Lippman, *ibid.*

²⁰ See, for example, Carl Dahlhaus, *ibid.* p. 31 κ.ε.

²¹ In contradistinction with the musical piece as a text that its mere reading cannot produce total meaning.

²² Tempo: «Quanto chiude la terra e il regno mio./ Se me veder non vuoi/ pensa di farti in Cielo un'alma sede;/ in Cielo, ov'io non giungo,/ e dove bella Eternita ridiede».

²³ See New Testament, According to John, 18, 35-37: «what hast thou done? 36 Jesus answered, My kingdom is not of this world: if my kingdom were of this world, then would my servants fight, that I should not be delivered to the Jews: but now is my kingdom not from hence. 37 Pilate therefore said unto him, Art thou a king then? Jesus answered; Thou sayest that I am a king. To this end was I born, and for this cause came I into the world, that I should bear witness unto the truth. Every one that is of the truth heareth my voice. 38 Pilate saith unto him, What is truth?»

²⁴ For the relation between Time and Truth, see Emmanuel Levinas, «Η ηθική σχέση και ο χρόνος», in *Ολότητα και άπειρο (Totalité et infini. Essai sur l' exteriorité)*, trsl. Κωστής Παπαγιώργης, Εξάντας editions, Athens 1989, p. 281-322. For the meaning of truth see Pascal Engel, *Η αλήθεια (La vérité. Réflexions sur quelques truisms)*, trsl. Στέλιος Βιρβιδάκης, Scripta editions, Athens 2000.

²⁵ We find two well-known examples in this category in the history of philosophy and science. First, the theory of Time by Plato in *Timaeus* were planets are set to the sky and follow a rhythmic movement analogous to the musical intervals. The aim of this placement of elements by the Creator is to count Time. See, Plato, *Timaeus*, 37. Another famous paradigm is found in the theory of musical spheres by Kepler, in *Harmonices Mundi* were the movement of the spheres on the sky create their own cosmical music.

²⁶ E.A. Lippman, *ibid.*

²⁷ Tempo: «In tre parti divide/ l'ore del viver tuo misura, e vedi;/ vedi il Tempo caduto,/ vedi, ngrata, il rifiuto/ dei lumi eterni, e vedi il prprio errore./ Vedi il presente, che nascendo muore./ Di la dal denso velo/ ove giace il futuro,/ se il tuo guardo non scopre,/ il varco e aperto alla speranza, all'opre».

²⁸ Augustine's analysis in *Confessions*, remains a classic reference in this subject: «What, then, is time? If no one asks me, I know what it is. If I wish to explain it to him who asks me, I do not know. Yet I say with confidence that I know that if nothing passed away, there would be no past time; and if nothing were still coming, there would be no future time; and if there were nothing at all, there would be no present time.

But, then, how is it that there are the two times, past and future, when even the past is now no longer and the future is now not yet? But if the present were always present, and did not pass into past time, it obviously would not be time but eternity. If, then, time present--if it be time--comes into existence only because it passes into time past, how can we say that even this is, since the cause of its being is that it will cease to be? Thus, can we not truly say that time is only as it tends toward nonbeing? », XIV, 17, transl. Albert C. Outler, <http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/basis/confessions-bod.asp>

²⁹ Rodolfo Venditti, *Μικρός οδηγός στη μεγάλη μουσική (Piccola guida alla grande musica)*, trsl. Καίτη Μαράκα, Στάχυ editions, Athens 1994, p. 103.

³⁰ Donald Borrows, *Handel*, Oxford University Press, Oxford 1994, p. 364.

³¹ Piacere: «Io prepare presenti contenti,/ e non offro un'immagine di benne/ ch'aggli eroi per idea s'invento».

³² See, for example, W. Windelband and H. Heimsoeth, *Εγχειρίδιο της Ιστορίας της Φιλοσοφίας (Lehrbuch der Geschichte der Philosophie)*, v.2, trsl. Ν.Μ. Σκουτερόπουλος, MIET editions, Athens 1995³