

Egert Poehlmann, 8.7.2011

Aristotle Politics VIII 6. 1340 b 20 - 1341 b 18.

1. Preliminaries.

Some of You might remember, that we, when studying Plato's last work in July 2010, the *Laws*, had to consider the relations of Plato's theory of art in the *Politeia* and in the *Laws* with Aristotle's *Poetics*. Aristotle was a member of the Academy from 367 B.C. until Plato's death (347 B.C.), whose successor was not Aristotle, but Plato's nephew Speusippus (347-339). In this period Aristotle could study Plato's *Republic* and witness Plato's work on the *Timaeus* and the *Laws*. From 347-342 Aristotle was in Assos and Mytilene, from 342 to 336 B.C. he was teacher of Young Alexander in Pella, from where he returned to Athens in 335/34, where he founded his own school, the Peripatos.

In his twenty years as a member of the Platonic Academy, Aristotle had the opportunity to attend in the Dionysus Theatre restaged tragedies of the fifth century and the first nights of new pieces of Middle Comedy. Aristotle's keen interest and thorough knowledge of the Athenian theatre is attested by many quotations of tragedies, comedies, performances and actors in the third book of his *Rhetoric* and in the *Poetics*. As he cannot have had the relevant experiences during his exile from 347 to 335, Walter Burkert¹ demonstrated that the third book of the *Rhetoric* and the *Poetics*, which are linked by cross-references, belong to the first period of Aristotle in Athens, the time of learning, arguing and dispute with Plato and Plato's works, between the years 367 and 347. Thus, we could understand the *Poetics* of Aristotle against the background of Plato's *Republic* and *Laws*.

We shall see that Book 8 of Aristotle's *Politics* is linked by many cross-references with Aristotle's *Poetics*, especially the famous theory of musical and theatrical *Catharsis* of the affections of the hearer and spectator of music and theatre. Therefore, we have to try to integrate book 8 of Aristotle's *Politics* into the first period of Aristotle in the Platonic Academy. In doing this we have to consider (1) the literary form of the *Politics*, and (2) the chronological segmentation of the *Politics*.

¹ Walter Burkert, "Aristoteles im Theater. Zur Datierung des 3. Buchs der 'Rhetorik' und der 'Poetik'", *MH* 32 (1975) 67-72.

(1) The *Politics* were not destined for publication as a piece of literature in artistic prose like the *Laws* of Plato. They are rather a collection of papers for the teaching in the Peripatos. It goes without saying that the respective parts of this material, being used several times, were changed when necessary with every repetition. We might confirm this result by our own experiences and techniques as academic teachers, for example in our Corfu seminaries. After a final revision, which Aristotle did not accomplish, the whole would have been not a Dialogue in artistic prose like the *Republic*, but a *Pragmateia*, a treatise on Politics. The material for this *Pragmateia* was assembled after Aristotle's death by a librarian, who did not interfere in the papers he found. Thanks to the usual conservative method of ancient editorial technique, we have a series of self-contained parts, which follow some reasonable plan. But there are many gaps, unfulfilled cross-references and missing connections. The text as transmitted in the manuscripts ends unfinished. Guilelmus Moerbeke, who translated the *Politics* for the first time into Latin in 1260, adds at the end: *Reliqua huius operis in Graeco nondum inveni.*

(2) Since the 16th century philologists have tried to reconstruct the original succession of the eight books of the *Politics*. Of course, the sequence of books 1-8 in the manuscripts is an achievement of late antiquity, when several papyrus scrolls containing separate books were assembled and transcribed into one parchment *codex*. But the results of the efforts of the philology of the 19th century were disappointing and confusing: The edition of Otto Immisch² enumerates four different editions with four different series of books, besides Immanuel Becker's edition published by the Berlin Academy (1831), which gives the sequence of the manuscripts.

Philologists trying to solve the internal problems of the *Politica* by changing the transmitted sequence of books, treat the *Politics* with the wrong assumption that Aristotle had written them in order to publish a piece of high literature. Therefore, Ulrich von Wilamowitz, while rejecting the aforesaid method, explained the *Politics* as an agglomeration of three different layers: Books 1-3 give introductory material. Books 4-6 draw on Aristotle's existing collection of *Politeiai*. Book 7/8 start to set up the ideal state in close connection with Platonic ideas. Thus, they are the earliest part of *Politics*. All in

²Otto Immisch, *Aristotelis Politica*, Leipzig 1929, VII.

all, this approach was not shaken by later investigation of the Politics from Werner Jaeger to Rudolf Stark.³

The new approach to research about Aristotle's *Politics* aims at the segregation of chronologically different layers of the *Politics* and seeks to attach them to different phases of Aristotle's life. Ernest Barker⁴ attaches books 7/8 to Aristotle's Assos-Period (347-344), books 1-3 tentatively to his Pella-Period (342-336), and books 4-6 to his Peripatos-Period (335-322). It is interesting that he admits that Aristotle, who had the opportunity for study and research with Plato from 367-347, might have conceived his books 7/8 already in his academic period.

Ingemar Düring⁵ pointed to the fact that books 1, 2, 3, 4-6 and 7/8 are preceeded by a general introduction and introduced by special headings: the theme of book 1 is "The Theory of the household" (περὶ οἰκονομίας, I 3. 1253 b2), book 2 is a review of earlier research about constitutions: "About the forerunners treating the question of the best state" (I 13. 1260 b23: Περὶ τῶν πρότερον ἀποφνηαμένων περὶ τῆς πολιτείας ἀρίστης). Book 3 contains mostly general reflexions about the constitution: "Whoever is considering the problems of the state, must first think about the nature of the state" (I 1.1274 b1-3: Τῷ περὶ πολιτείας ἐπισκοποῦντι ... σχεδὸν πρώτη σκέψις περὶ πόλεως ἰδεῖν, τί ποτέ ἐστι ἡ πόλις). Books 4-6 are introduced by a heading which is taken up later, at the beginning of book 7: "We have now to deal with the best state, which way it may come to being and which way it may be durable" (III 12. 1288 b3/4: Περὶ τῆς πολιτείας ἥδη πειρατέον λέγειν τῆς ἀρίστης, τίνα πέφυκε γίνεσθαι τρόπον καὶ καθίστασθαι πῶς). Books 7/8 are introduced by "Whosoever wants to investigate the best state must first establish which is the best way of life (VII 1. 1323 a14/15: Περὶ πολιτείας ἀρίστης τὸν μέλλοντα ποιήσασθαι ζητήσιν ἀνάγκη διορίσασθαι πρῶτον τίς αἰρετώτατος βίος). It is evident that we have five independent treatises before a revision, which might have made of them an selfcontained *Pragmateia*.

Like Wilamowitz, Düring pointed out that books 7-8 about the ideal state are by far the earliest of these treatises, as they are using on the whole platonic terminology.

³Werner Jaeger, *Aristoteles*, Berlin 1923, Rudolf Stark, *Aristotelesstudien*, München 1972. See also Fritz-Peter Hager (Hrsg.), *Ethik und Politik des Aristoteles*, Darmstadt 1972, Peter Steinmetz (Hrsg.), *Schriften zu den Politika des Aristoteles*, Hildesheim-New York 1973.

⁴Ernest Barker, "Life of Aristotle and Composition of Politics", *Classical Review* 45 (1931) 162-172.

⁵Ingemar Düring, *Aristoteles. Darstellung und Interpretation seines Denkens*. Heidelberg 1966.

Their starting point is the "second best state" in book 5 of Plato's *Laws* (739 e). Therefore Düring, while admitting (p. 474) that every treatise which later became part of the *Politics* was reworked after Aristotle's return to Athens after 335 B.C. left open the possibility (p. 474 f.) that books 7/8 of the *Politics* belong to Aristotle's time in the Academy some years before Plato's death (367-347 B.C.), the same period into which Burkert has convincingly dated the *Poetics* of Aristotle. We have seen that the *Poetics* give clear evidence for fundamental argument and dispute in the Academy. The same might be true for book 8 of the *Politics*, which is connected with the *Poetics* by the known cross-reference to the *Poetics* concerning *katharsis* (1341 b38-40).

2. The sources of Aristotle in book 8 of *Politics*.

Plato's last work, the unfinished *Laws*, were in the making in his last 6 years, from 353 to 347/6, a fact which might have raised the discussion in the Academy about musical education again, after the impact of the *Republic*. This is more than a possibility, as there is evidence that book 8 of the *Politics* mirrors the discussion in the Academy about musical education. Plato, when writing his famous chapter on music, harmonies, rhythms and instruments in the *Republic* (III 398-400), is not inclined to explain technicalities. Therefore he makes his Socrates refer to the specialist, Damon of Oa: "Let us discuss these questions with Damon (III 400 b1/2: ἄλλὰ ταῦτα μὲν ... καὶ μετὰ Δάμῳνος βουλευσόμεθα). Likewise, Aristotle in the *Politics*, when he has to evaluate harmonies, rhythms, melodies and instruments, restricts himself to general regulations, referring the interested to the specialists of musical theory, on which he draws. Of course, he does not give names. But his vivid periphrases of his sources mirror the discussion in the Academy in Aristotle's academic period (367-347 B.C.):

The first reference to musicological sources appears at the end of chapter 5 after a digression (1340 a28-38), which deals with the question, if paintings are able to express affections (ἡθος). Aristotle gives as examples the painter Pauson and Polygnotus, whom he considers in the *Poetics* a good painter of character (1450 a27/28: ὁ μὲν γὰρ Πολύγνωτος ἀγαθὸς ἡθόγραφος). Though there was contemporary discussion about the question - see Xenophon *Memorabilia* III 10⁶ - Aristotle does not give a source. But the domain of ἡθος is music: "In the melodies there are imitations of

⁶See Felix Preishofen, "Sokrates im Gespräch mit Parrhasios und Kleiton", *Festschrift Gundert*, Freiburg 1974.

character" (1340 a38/39: ἐν δὲ τοῖς μέλεσιν αὐτοῖς ἔστι μιμήματα τῶν ἡθῶν). This is the beginning of a long excursus about the expression of affections by melodies and rhythms (1340 a38 - 40 b12), which has been discussed already by Andrew Barker. The sources of this excursus are diligently specified: "This point is aptly explained by philosophers of education. For they take the evidence for their theories from the facts themselves" (1340 b5-7: ταῦτα γὰρ καλῶς λέγουσιν οἱ περὶ τὴν παιδείαν ταύτην πεφιλοσοφηκότες. Λαμβάνουσι γὰρ τὰ μαρτύρια τῶν λόγων ἐξ αὐτῶν τῶν ἔργων). Perhaps Aristotle is pointing to Damon, Plato's source in the *Republic* (see above). But an old member of the Academy, Heraclides Ponticus, had dealt with the expressive values of the harmonies also (Fragment 162/163 Wehrli). It is interesting that Aristotle qualifies the method of his source, which takes the evidence for theories from the facts themselves. This is Aristotle's (and Aristoxenos') own method, the induction.

The next references appear in chapters 6 and 7 and shall be conveniently treated in their context. Here a commented preview might be helpful: In 1340 b18 (πολλοὶ φασὶ τῶν σοφῶν) the Pythagorean and Platonic theories about soul and harmony are mentioned.⁷ In 1340 b35 (πρὸς τοὺς φάσκοντας) and b40 (ἦν τινες ἐπιτιμῶσι) Aristotle refers to musicologists who reject teaching the young singing and playing an instrument altogether. In 1341 a26 he cites earlier musicologists, perhaps again Damon and Plato (οἱ πρότερον), who rejected aulos-playing in education and by free citizens (ἐλεύθεροι) altogether, and adds a long digression about the aulos and its use in the past. In 1341 b2/3 unspecified ἀρχαῖοι are mentioned as a source for the well-known stories of Athena and the aulos. In 1341 b21 (τοῖς πρὸς παιδείαν διαπονοῦσι) Aristotle refers to experts in education. In 1341 b27-29 Aristotle refers to contemporary musicologists (τῶν δὲ νῦν) and philosophers, who are experts in musical education. In 1341 b33/34 he cites philosophers (τινες τῶν ἐν φιλοσοφίᾳ), who propose the classification of melodies into ἡθικά, πρακτικά and ἐνθουσιαστικὰ μέλη. The next three quotations can be connected with Aristoxenos: In 1342 a31 Aristotle refers to members of his school (κοινωνοὶ τῆς ἐν φιλοσοφίᾳ διατριβῆς), the Peripatos, and members with special expertise in musical education, who attack the Socrates of Plato in the *Republic* (399-

⁷See Plato, *Phaedo* 86, where the pythagorean Simmias holds that human soul is a harmony, like Aristoxenus (fr. 118-121 Wehrli) and Dicaearchus. In *Phaedo* 93 Socrates takes the opinion that the human soul has harmony.

400) for eliminating all harmonies except the Dorian and the Phrygian. In 1342 b8 he quotes the same experts for the question of the close connection of the Phrygian Harmonia and the Aulos. Finally, in 1342 b23, he quotes the same musicologists who attack again the Socrates of Plato in *Republic* 399-400 for eliminating the slack harmonies altogether.

3. Politics 8.6. 1340 b20 - 31. Music in Education.

Already in book 7 (1332 a33) Aristotle begins to treat the subject of education in the ideal state, which is carried on in book 8. At the end of book 7, three new questions are raised, namely: "The first is whether there ought to be some code of regulations governing the education of children. The second is whether the education of children should be a matter for the state, or should be conducted on a private basis, as it still is, even today, in the great majority of cases. The third question which we have to consider is the proper nature of a code of regulations" (7, 1337 a3-6, translation Ernest Barker⁸). These questions find their answers in book 8, which treats, in the unfinished form we have, first generalities (1337 a11 - 1338 b8), then gymnastics (1338 b9 - 1339 a10) and finally music (1339 a11 - 1342 b34).

The heading of chapter 6 of book 8 raises the question if children should be taught to sing and to play instruments: "Now we have to explain, if the children shall learn to sing and to play instruments, a question which has been raised earlier" (1340 b20 f.: Πότερον δὲ δεῖ μανθάνειν ἄδοντας τε καὶ χειρουργούντας ἢ μή, καθάπερ ἤπορήθη πρότερον, νῦν λεκτέον). With πρότερον Aristotle gives a cross-reference to 1339 a33 - b11, where the contrary view of some opponents are quoted (1339 b3 ὡς φασί). Now, Aristotle takes side recommending a moderate part of musical practice (ἔργα), as one of the aims of musical education is the ability to judge expertly about the moral quality of melodies (κριτὰς γενέσθαι σπουδαίους 1340 b25). This ability can only be acquired by some experience in singing and playing instruments. The notion of musical judgment (κρίνειν ὀρθῶς) is already prepared in 1340 a17. We find the notion of expertise in musical judgment again in Pseudo-Plutarch *De Musica* (1144 C-E), where Aristoxenos as source might be indicated (1142 B). But the κριτικὴ πραγματεία in *De Musica*, which is aiming at the cultivation of a mature musicologist, is developed on

⁸Andrew Barker, *Greek Musical Writings*, Vol. 1, *The Musician and his Art*, Cambridge 1984.

higher level. Aristotle is still concentrating on the education of children, which he illustrates by the example of the babies' rattle, the proverbial ' Ἀρχύτου πλαταγή,⁹ which is used in order to occupy babies. Likewise, some practical training in music may aptly occupy older children.

4. Politics 1340 b31 - 41 a17. Opinions of opponents.

The next section (1340 b33 - 41 a5) quotes again opponents, who consider practical singing and playing instruments to be an occupation for lower classes: "against those who consider practical music making a low class occupation" (1340 b34/35: πρὸς τοὺς φάσκοντας βάνουσον εἶναι τὴν ἐπιμέλειαν) or reproach music with degrading men to a lower level: "About the reproach that music making degrades people to lower class standard" (1340 b40/41: περὶ δὲ τῆς ἐπιτιμήσεως ἦν τινες ἐπιτιμῶσιν ὡς ποιούσης τῆς μουσικῆς βαναύσους). Aristotle's retorts to his opponents are based on several restrictions of singing and playing instruments as part of musical education.

Considering the age of pupils he limits the time for practical music to the first years, after which the children have acquired a safe judgement about morally good and bad melodies (1340 b35-39). As the children must be trained for the virtues of a citizen, it must be considered how far they shall participate in singing and playing instruments, which melodies and rhythms they may meet, and on which instruments they shall be trained: "We have to consider up to which point children, who are trained for the virtues of a citizen, may take part in practical music making, and with which melodies and rhythms they shall be acquainted, and on which instruments the training shall be executed (1340 b41 - 41 a4: σκεψαμένους μέχρι τε πόσου τῶν ἔργων κοινωνητέον τοῖς πρὸς ἀρετὴν παιδευομένοις πολιτικῆν, καὶ ποίων μελῶν καὶ ποίων ῥυθμῶν κοινωνητέον, ἔτι δὲ ἐν ποίοις ὀργάνοις τὴν μάθησιν ποιητέον).

The evaluation of melodies and rhythms is postponed to the end of the chapter (1341 b19 - 42 b34), Thus, the question of μέχρι πόσου (1341 a4-17) stands first. As it must be admitted that some styles of music may have a degrading effect on players and hearers (οὐδὲν γὰρ κωλύει τρόπους τινὰς τῆς μουσικῆς ἀπεργάζεσθαι τὸ λεχθέν), the musical training must be limited to such an extent that it will not hamper the military training and the training for the life in the polis. Therefore, the children must not be

⁹Invention of Archytas: Plutarch, *convivium* VII 10.1, *Moralia* 714 e. Aelian, *Varia Historia* XII 15, Suda s.v. Archytas, Pollux IX 127: from Aristoxenus, biography of Archytas (47-56 Wehrli) ?

trained in the skills required either for the musical contests of professionals (1341 a10: πρὸς τοὺς ἀγῶνας τοὺς τεχνικοὺς), or for the brilliant but superfluous effects of performance which today have entered the contests and from there the education (1342 a12: ἃ νῦν ἐλήλυθεν εἰς τοὺς ἀγῶνας). Rather they must be trained in moderate music to the extent that will enable them to enjoy morally good melodies and rhythms, and not only appreciate the universal charm of music, which pleases some animals and the great majority of slaves and children.

The universal charm of music is pleasure, which has been explained in a parenthesis earlier: "The nature of music is pleasure" (1340 a4: ἔχει γὰρ ἡ μουσική τὴν ἡδονὴν φυσικήν). Thus, the use of music is welcome to all age and character. But pleasure itself is not the aim of music, but only a means to improve the character and the soul.

5. The Dangers of Professionalism.

It is interesting to notice Aristotle's reference to the dangers (νῦν) of contemporary extravagances in professional musical contests. This points to the so called "New Music", a revolution of musical styles, which we know thanks to the opposition of "Old Comedy", Pherecrates, Aristophanes and others, and Plato in the *Republic* and the *Laws*. As examples, we can select two exponents of "New Music", the Citharode Timotheus of Miletus, and the Auletes Pronomus of Thebes. Both of them have to do with a technical development of musical instruments.

Timotheus (about 450-360) was a pupil of Phrynis, and like his teacher famous as composer of Citharodic Nomoi.¹⁰ He was notorious because of his arrogance, which shows itself in two fragments.¹¹ Timotheus is said to have composed amongst other poems 19 Citharodic Nomoi, 18 Dithyrambs and 21 Hymns,¹² of which titles and fragments are preserved.¹³ We have also the second half of the Nomos *Persai* on a papyrus of the 4th century B.C, affording better understanding of the structure of the Nomos and the rhythmic peculiarities of Timotheus.¹⁴ In the *sphragis* of the *Persai* (l.

10PMG nr. 777-804; Hordern 2002.

11Fr. 796; 802 Hordern.

12Suda s.v. Τιμόθεος; Hordern 2002, p. 9 f.

13Hordern 2002, p. 10-14.

14Hordern 2002, nr. 791.

202-236) Timotheus draws a line from the musical achievements of Orpheus via Terpander's contribution to his own person, claiming for himself the invention of the cithara with eleven strings.¹⁵ As Stefan Hagel has demonstrated, the virtuoso cithara was equipped with eleven strings not in order to increase the compass of the instrument, but in order to introduce alternative strings, which allowed the performer to play different harmoniai on the same instrument without retuning individual strings.¹⁶ Thus, he had the possibility to introduce manifold modulations (μεταβολαί), which were one of the stumbling-blocks of the conservative opposition.

Pronomus of Thebes (about 400 B.C.)¹⁷ was a renowned virtuoso on the aulos. He is credited with the invention of the poly-modal aulos, on which it was possible to play different harmoniai. A famous vase-painting (Naples H 3240, about 400 B.C.) shows him in the center of a rehearsal for a satyr play of the poet Demetrios, who is depicted also with the text of his play, a papyrus scroll, in his hands. Again, Stefan Hagel¹⁸ helps to understand this invention. The archaic and early classic auloi for the Dorian, Phrygian and Lydian harmonia, two pipes with four finger-holes and a thumb-hole each, were limited to one harmonia and two tetrachords. The late classic "Proslambanomenos Aulos" expanded the compass as far as the proslambanomenos of the respective tonos, which made it possible to sound the *Nete* and higher notes by overblowing in the twelfth. The next step, the "Tonoι Aulos", has sliders which close the three lowest holes, and alternative finger-holes at the other end. This technique gave Pronomus the possibility of playing different harmoniai on the same instrument. The "Roman Imperial Aulos" was equipped with rotatable collars instead of sliders.¹⁹

6. Politics 1341 a17 - b18. Instruments.

It goes without saying that the classic seven-stringed lyra just like the classic non-modulating aulos was technically still within reach of amateurish music-making, whereas the expensive instruments for the virtuosi about 400 B.C. could no longer have

¹⁵*Persai* 221 f.: πρῶτος ποικιλόμουσον Ὀρφεὺς <χέλ>υν ἐτέκνωσεν; 225 f.: Τέρπανδρος δ' ἐπὶ τῷ δέκα/ξεῦξε Μοῦσαν ἐν ᾧδαϊς; 229-31: νῦν δὲ Τιμόθεος μέτροις/ῥυθμοῖς τ' ἐνδεκακρουμάτοις/κίθαριν ἐξανατέλλει.

¹⁶Stefan Hagel, *Ancient Greek Music. A New Technical History*. Cambridge 2010, 76-87.

¹⁷Pausanias 9.12.5, Athenaios 631 e. See West (1992) 87, 366 f.

¹⁸Hagel (2009) 393-413 ("Early auloi"), 290-292; 319-323; 332-343 ("Proslambanomenos Aulos"), 343-351; 361-364 ("Hellenistic Tonoι-Aulos"), 351-361 ("Roman Imperial Auloi").

¹⁹Max Wegner, *Das Musikleben der Griechen*, Berlin 1949, 232, pl. 25

a place in education. Nevertheless, Aristotle excludes in the next section (1341 a17 - b1) not only the auloi, but the cithara and all similar stringed instruments with the exception of the lyra from the use in education (1341 a18/19: οὐτε γὰρ αὐλοὺς εἰς παιδείαν ἀκτέον οὔτ' ἄλλο τι τεχνικὸν ὄργανον, οἷον κιθάραν κἂν εἴ τι ἕτερόν ἐστιν). The reason is the professional character (τεχνικόν) of the instruments, which had been apparent after the inventions of the polymodal aulos by Pronomus and the eleven strings by Timotheus. Later, Aristotle excludes other stringed instruments, whether because they aimed only at the pleasure of the listeners (1341 a40: τὰ πρὸς ἡδονὴν συντείνοντα) or because they required technical skill (1341 b1: πάντα τὰ δεόμενα χειρουργικῆς ἐπιστήμης), or both.

Aristle's catalogue of unwelcome instruments recalls the Socrates of Plato in the *Republic*, who excludes, besides the aulos, the spindle-harp (τρίγωνον), other types of harps (πηκτίς) and similar instruments from the ideal state because of their many strings, which allow them to play more than one harmonia (III 399 CD: Τριγώνων ἄρα καὶ πηκτίδων καὶ πάντων ὀργάνων ὅσα πολύχορδα καὶ πολυαρμόνια, δημιουργοὺς οὐ Θρέψωμεν). It is interesting that Plato does not yet banish the cithara (III 399 D7: λύρα ... καὶ κιθάρα λείπεται κατὰ πόλιν χρήσιμα). Aristotle adds to the platonic catalogue, besides the aulos, the cithara and three more stringed instruments, first the barbitos, a lower variant of the lyra, which is depicted until 400 B.C. on vase pictures as familiar in the symposion, then the heptagonon, an unknown type of harp, and the sambyke, a small and high pitched type of harp. Τρίγωνον and πηκτίς appear on vase-pictures in the hands of women, either in family contexts or for the *amusement* in the context of the symposion. This holds good for the aulos also. Countless pictures on vases show hetaeras playing the aulos in the symposion in unequivocal erotic contexts.

Interspersed among the stringed instruments is a long digression about the aulos (1341 a18-38), which shares with the professional stringed instruments the deficiency that it does not improve the manners and virtues of the children listening to it. A special deficiency of the aulos is the different character of the instrument: "Again, the aulos is not a moral instrument (ἠθικόν) but rather one that excites the emotions (ὀργιαστικόν), so that it should be used in the kinds of circumstances where the spectacle offers more potential for κάθαρσις than for learning" (1341 a21-24, translation Andrew Barker).

Another deficiency is the fact that the aulos-player, unlike the lyra-player, cannot play and sing simultaneously (1341 a24/25). Thus aulos-playing, devoid of the meaningful word, cannot contribute to the education of player and listener. Of course, the argument is a weak one, given the possibility of aulodia. But it mirrors the deep distrust of every kind of pure instrumental music, which transpires in Plato's *Laws*: "[composers] setting melody and rhythm without words, and using the kithara and the aulos without the voice, a practice in which it is extremely difficult - since rhythm and harmonia occur with no words - to understand what is intended and what worthwhile representation it is like" (*Laws* II 669 E: μέλος δ' αὖ καὶ ῥυθμὸν ἄνευ ῥημάτων, ψιλῆ κιθάρησι τε καὶ αὐλήσι προσχρώμενοι, ἐν οἷς δὴ παγχαλεπὸν ἄνευ λόγου γιγνόμενον ῥυθμὸν τε καὶ ἁρμονίαν γινώσκειν ὅτι τε βούλεται, translation Andrew Barker).

In this section two new *termini* are introduced, ὀργιαστικόν denoting religious excitement and κάθαρσις in the sense of relief from emotion. The former (ὀργιαστικόν) is an Aristotelian ἄπαξ λεγόμενον. It reappears only once, in Aristotle *Politics* 1342 b3, again in connection with the aulos, and the phrygian harmonia. The cognate expression ἐξοργιάζοντα τὴν ψυχὴν μέλη (melodies which stir the soul to religious frenzy) appears only once (*Politics* 1342 a9/10) in connection with the κάθαρσις, and later only twice in Philodemus, in connection with bacchic ecstasy.²⁰ The latter *terminus* (κάθαρσις) reappears later several times (1341 b38/39, 1342 a11.14/15) and is better explained in its context.

The orgiastic character of the aulos and its destination for purely instrumental music without the support of the word entitled the forefathers, according to Aristotle, to exclude the use of the aulos from the education and from the life of free citizens, which had been usual before (1341 a26-28: διὸ καλῶς ἀπεδοκίμασαν οἱ πρότερον αὐτοῦ τὴν χρῆσιν ἐκ τῶν νέων καὶ τῶν ἐλευθέρων, καίπερ χρησάμενοι τὸ πρῶτον αὐτῷ). It is interesting that Aristotle (or his source) tries to find a chronological frame for this development: Before the Persian wars, the Greeks, because of their affluence (εὐπορία), had more leisure. And before and after them, with increased selfconfidence because of their deeds, they were eager to learn indiscriminately (1341 a28-31). Thus, they introduced aulos-playing into education (1341 a32: διὸ καὶ τὴν αὐλητικὴν ἤγαγον

²⁰Philodemus, *De Musica* col. 67.3, p. 130 Delattre; 96.8, p.185 Delattre.

πρὸς τὰς μαθήσεις).

7. Instruments on Vase-Paintings.

Aristotle's report is confirmed by Homer and vase paintings: the auloi are known as oriental instruments since the Doloneia in the Iliad (10,13: ἀυλῶν συρίγγων τ' ἐνοπήν); they accompany dancing in the description of Achilles' shield (18,495: ἀυλοὶ φόρμιγγές τε βοῆν ἔχον). On the "Chigikanne" (Rom, Villa Giulia, 640 B.C.) the auloi lead the phalanx of hoplites in war²¹, as was still usual in Sparta in the fifth century B.C.²² Since 570 they appear in the hands of the attendants of Dionysus, the Silenes,²³ and are used by hetaeras in the symposium in order to amuse drinking young men.²⁴

The use of the aulos in education can be easily checked by F.A. Becks "Album of Greek Education, which shows that from 500 B.C. the aulos was part of musical education. For the education of young boys, the examples cover the first half of the fifth century B.C. and stop completely after 450 B.C. There are three examples for teaching of playing the aulos with or without the help of a stringed instrument,²⁵ three examples for the aulos in an unspecified educational context,²⁶ and seven examples for teaching melodies with the help of the aulos.²⁷

The role of the aulos in the education of girls is different. There are some examples for the aulos in the contexts of private music-making.²⁸ But the bulk of the

21 Erika Simon - Max und Albert Hirmer, *Die griechischen Vasen*, München 1981, 25/26, VII, S. 48 f.

22 See Thukydides 5,28/30: Λακεδαιμόνιοι [χωροῦντες] δὲ βραδέως καὶ ὑπὸ ἀυλητῶν πολλῶν νόμῳ ἔγκαθεστῶτων.

23 See Simon 52/53 (Florenz, 570/65, Hephaestus, Silen with aulos; XVI-XVII (Asby Castle, 530 B.C., Dionysus, Silens with auloi), 120/121 (München, 500/490, Silens with aulos, Dionysus, Maenads).

24 See Simon 110 (Basel, 515 B.C., Hetaera with aulos, young men with wine cup).

25 F.A. Beck "Album of Greek Education (Sydney 1975): nr. 97 (Wien, 500-470, pupil aulos-playing, teacher listening), Beck nr. 98 (London, 470 B.C., pupil aulos-playing, teacher listening), Beck nr. 100 (pupil aulos-playing, teacher playing the barbitos).

26 Beck nr. 63 (Berlin, 450 B.C., three pupils in the schoolroom, one of them with an aulos in hand. On the wall of the schoolroom tablets), Beck nr. 9 (Schwerin, 460 B.C., music lessons, one pupil with aulos in hand), Beck nr. 113 (Oxford, 500-450, Aulosbläser in front of Herm, 2 pupils).

27 Beck nr. 54 (Berlin, 485 B.C., the famous Duris cup, teacher playing the aulos, pupil singing), Beck nr. 101 (Melbourne, 450 B.C., teacher playing the aulos, pupil singing), Beck nr. 115/16 (New York, 480-70, two pairs of aulos-playing teachers and two singing pupils), Beck nr. 117 (Brüssel, 475 B.C., teacher playing the aulos, pupil singing), Beck nr. 119 (Oxford, 485 B.C., teacher playing the aulos, pupil reading in a scroll, singing ?), Beck nr. 120 (München 475-50, teacher playing the aulos, pupil singing), Beck nr. 121 (Leyden, 475-50, teacher playing the aulos, pupil singing). For the Duris-Cup (Beck 53/54) see the coloured reproductions in Vinzenz Brinkmann (Hrsg.), *Die Launen des Olymp. Der Mythos von Athena, Marsyas und Apoll*, Frankfurt 2008, Liebighaus, Abb. 98/99.

28 Beck nr. 400 (Petersburg, 450-20, girl with aulos, girl with lyra), Beck nr. 403 (Hamburg, 440 B.C., girl with aulos, girl with lyra), Beck nr. 404 (440-30, girl with aulos, girl with lyra).

examples, which covers the period from 500-420, is uniform: there are ten pictures of an aulos-playing female teacher training a girl for dance with krotala.²⁹ In two cases the girls dance to the music of the aulos without krotala.³⁰ These scenes look rather like training of girls for the familiar profession of hetaeras.

Vase-pictures give evidence for the widespread use of the aulos in the first half of the fifth century B.C. in every part of public and private life.³¹ For this fact, Aristotle quotes two examples. In Sparta, some χορηγός (sponsor of the chorus) played the aulos himself (1341 a33/34: καὶ γὰρ ἐν Λακεδαίμονί τις χορηγὸς αὐτὸς ἤλυσεν τῷ χορῷ), though it was usual to allot to the chorus a hired professional as aulos-player. And in Athens nearly every free citizen (ἐλεύθερος) was able to play the aulos. The Athenian example for this is puzzling: Aristotle quotes a honorary inscription of a certain Thrasippus, who was the sponsor for the chorus for a poet of Old Comedy, Ekphantides.³² This poet was a contemporary of Cratinus, who quoted a fragment of him.³³ The usual form of such an honorary inscription of 476 B.C., concerning the *Phoenissae* of Phrynichus and the sponsor of the chorus, Themistocles, is quoted by Plutarch:³⁴ Θεμιστοκλῆς Φρεάρριος ἐχορήγει, Φρύνιχος ἐδίδασκεν, Ἄδειμαντος ἦρχεν. Of course, such an inscription cannot give evidence for the widespread (ἐπεχωρίασεν) ability of Athenian freeborn citizens to play the aulos. Perhaps the Thrasippus-Inscription mentioned that the sponsor Thrasippus (like the unknown Spartan χορηγός), or the poet Ekphantides himself,³⁵ accompanied the chorus with the aulos.

The vase pictures give evidence for a change of musical taste after 450 B.C., for which Aristotle tries to find an explanation: "Their experience later caused them to reject it [the aulos], when they were better able to judge what is conducive to virtue and what is not. Similarly, they rejected many of the instruments used by the ancients" (1341 a38/39: ὕστερον δ' ἀπεδοκιμάσθη, διὰ τῆς πείρας αὐτῆς, βέλτιον δυναμένων κρίνειν τὸ πρὸς ἀρετὴν καὶ τὸ μὴ πρὸς ἀρετὴν συντεῖνον; translation Barker). There follows

29 Beck nrs. 374-383; 391.

30 Beck nrs. 379; 395 (twice).

31 See Wegner (1949) p. 187-198.

32 See PCG V T 3.

33 Ekphantides Fr. 4 = Cratinus Fr. 361, 1.

34 Plutarch, *Vita Themistoclis* 5, 5.

35 Thus the scholion to 1341 a35/36: Ὁ Θρασίππος χορηγῆσας πίνακα τῷ Ἐκφαντίδῃ ἀύλησαντι ἐν τῇ χορηγίᾳ.

the aforesaid supplement to the list of unwelcome instruments, following the Socrates of Plato in the *Republic*.

The ability to judge what is conducive to virtue and what is not has been labelled since Abert as "Ethoslehre"³⁶. Andrew Barker has admirably illustrated Aristotle's contribution to the "Ethos" of harmonies and rhythms, which draws on Plato's famous music chapter in *Republic* book three. For the theory of rhythm (*Republic* 3, 399 E; see Aristotle, *Politics* 1340 b7-10) Plato refers to Damon of Oa as source (Ἴ Ἀλλὰ ταῦτα μὲν ... καὶ μετὰ Δάμωνος βουλευσόμεθα). By extension, the same might be guessed for the chapters about harmonies (*Republic* 3, 399 D; see Aristotle, *Politics* 1340 a40-b5) and instruments (*Republic* 3, 399 C, see Aristotle, *Politics* 1341 a17-b1). Indeed, Francois Laserre included these paragraphs into his controversial collection of Damonian fragments.³⁷

Damon was political and cultural counsellor of Pericles.³⁸ After the construction of the Odeion of Pericles in 444 B.C: and the first Panatheniac contest in the new building in 443 B.C. he fell into disgrace in the polis for μεγαλομανία and τυρραννοφιλία³⁹. The τύρρανος aimed at was of course Pericles.⁴⁰ So Damon was ostracized after 443 B.C. and could not return to Athens earlier than 433 B.C. Before his ostracismos he published his "Areopagiticus", a pamphlet on music and education, of which scanty fragments remain. The "Areopagiticus" might have been one reason for his ostracismos. Andrew Barker has assembled the elements of his theories carefully.⁴¹ But it is utterly improbable that Damon's controversial pamphlet alone could have changed the opinion of the public concerning music so radically. For the elimination of the aulos after 450 B.C. we must look for other reasons. Aristotle gives us a hint in his last section on auloi:

8. Athena, Marsyas and the Auloi.

"The fable told by the ancients about the auloi also has a sound rational basis: they say that Athena invented the auloi and then threw them away. It makes a good story to say that the goddess did this because she was put out by the way it distorted

36H. Abert, *Die Lehre vom Ethos in der griechischen Musik*, Leipzig 1899.

37Francois Laserre, *Plutarque, De la Musique*, Olten-Lausanne 1954, p. 74-79.

38Platon Comicus, *inc. Fab.*, PCGr 7, Fr. 207; Damon, Fr. A 2 and 7 Diehls.

39Damon, Fr. A 1, 4 and 6Diels.

40Cratinus, *Cheirones*, PCGr 4, Fr. 258.

41Barker (1984) 168/9.

her face; but it is more likely to have been because training in aulos-playing contributes nothing to the intelligence, knowledge and skill being things that we attribute to Athena" (1341 b2-8; translation Barker).

The invention of the auloi by Athene is told by Pindar in 490 B.C. in the twelfth Pythic ode for the competition of the aulos-player Midas of Akragas. Athena invented the instrument, which she used first for the imitation of the lamentations of the sisters of the Gorgo Medusa, who had been beheaded by Perseus with the help of Athena. Later, she did not throw the instrument away, as the later sources tell, but, according to Pindar, gave it as a gift to mortal men together with a solo-piece for auloi, the lamentations of the sisters of Medusa, for which she coined the title "Nomos Polykephalos".

The shame of aulos-playing Athena appears later, in the *Marsyas* of Melanippides of Melos (about 480-430).⁴² Athena and her distorted face is depicted on vase-pictures: On a crater of the fourth century B.C., Athena playing the aulos sees her face in a mirror, which is held for her by a young man.⁴³ The version of the legend, which makes Athene throw away the disfiguring instrument, became canonical, as we can see by the famous bronze-group of Athena and Marsyas, a chef-oeuvre of the sculptor Myron of Erythrai, which was installed about 440 B.C. before the western front of the Parthenon⁴⁴ during the construction of the Periclean Parthenon, which was erected from 447-432 B.C. by Ictinus and Callicrates.

The Liebig-Haus in Frankfurt has the best replica in marble of the Myronian Athena; the best marble replica of the Myronian Marsyas is housed by the Museum of the Vatican. In the garden of the Liebig-Haus there is a bronze replica of the whole group, which was founded in 1982.⁴⁵ (see plate). Athena just has thrown away the auloi, which the curious Marsyas discovers in the same moment. It is obvious that the Athena-Marsyas-group in such a prominent place, under the western pediment of the Parthenon, must bear a political message of Pericles, just as the figures of the Periclean Parthenon did. While the figures of the eastern pediment represented the birth of Athena from the head of Zeus, the figures of the western pediment represented the struggle of

42Athenaios *Deipnosophists* 616 e: ἔρρετ' αἴσχρα, σώματι λύμα / οὐ με τᾷδ' ἐγὼ κακώτατι δίδωμι.

43Brinkmann (2008) Abb. 17, Boston, 4th century B.C.

44Pausanias 1, 24, 1.

45Brinkmann (2008) Abb. 47.

Poseidon, offering the Athenians a fountain of salt water, and Athena, offering the olive tree.

But what is the meaning of the Athene-Marsyas-Group? Some have seen hostility against Thebes,⁴⁶ from where the best professional aulos-players came.⁴⁷ But the legendary Marsyas had nothing to do with Boeotia, as he was at home in Phrygia, as everybody knew. That aulos-players, who were hired for the accompaniment of the chorus, tried already about 490 B.C. to push forward their part at the expense of the chorus, transpires in the famous Pratinas-Fragment.⁴⁸ Interesting is the context in Athenaios: "But Pratinas of Phlius, when auletes and dancers who performed for hire took over the dance-floors, took offence at the way the auletes failed to play accompaniments for the choruses, as had been traditional, but the choruses, instead, sang accompaniments to the auletes" (Athenaios 617 bc, translation Barker). The author of Pseudo-Plutarch *De Musica* dates these quarrels in the second half of the fifth century. "In the old days, up to the time of Melanippides, the composer of dithyrambos, the auletes were generally paid by the poets, which shows that poetry took pride of place, and the auletes were subordinate to their instructors, but later this custom too was abandoned" (*De Musica* 1141 cd, translation Barker). But these facts explain neither the abolition of the aulos in education, which is attested by vase-painting, nor the prominent position of Myron's Athene-Marsyas-Group before the Periclean Parthenon.

The solution must be sought in the political context. In 477 B.C. Cimon negotiated the ionic-attic confederation, the cash of which was transferred in 454 B.C. from Delos to Athens. The place of it was later the opisthodomos of the Parthenon. In 448 B.C. Pericles negotiated a peace-treaty with Persia, and in 446 a peace-treaty with Sparta, which allowed Athens to transform the ionic-attic confederation into a naval empire. This situation gave the Athenians a new sense of identity, one that deliberately distanced them from oriental barbarians. This might be the message of Myron's group: Athene, the essence of intelligence, knowledge and skill (remember *Politics* 1341 b6-8) opposed to the barbarian from Phrygia, to whom the orgiastic and irrational instrument

46See Brinkmann (2008) 78/79.

47See West (1992) 366, who lists for the fifth and early fourth century 14 aulos-Virtuosi from Thebes.

48Pratinas Fr. 708 PMG.

is much better suited. Of course, everybody knew how the legend continued: Marsyas, having trained himself in aulos-playing to the point of virtuosity, aroused the jealousy of Apollo, who was victor in a contest which he won by a trick, and ordered Marsyas to be skinned.

In the following section, Aristotle comes back to his topic, education: "We reject, then, a technical education in instruments and in performance on them. By "technical" education we mean that which equips people for competitive performances" (1341 b8-10, translation Barker). Following Plato in the *Laws* (659 bc) Aristotle points to the fact that playing in competitive performances does not promote the virtue of the player himself, but only the pleasure of the listeners, which is a job for hired people and not for free men, and might deprave the players, who aim at assimilation to the depraved character of a depraved audience.

F.A. Beck, Album of Greek Education, Sydney 1975

III	500-450		
54	Berlin	485 Duris	B aulos Gesangsunterricht Lyra
63	Berlin	450	B aulos Gesangsunterricht? tablets
97	Wien	500-470	A aulos Lehrer Lyra
98	London	470	A aulos Lehrer Lyra
99	Schwerin	460	aulos Lyra Unterricht
100	London	475-450	3 auloi barbitos Aulos-Unterricht
101	Melbourne	450	I aulos B aulos Gesangsunterricht Lyra
113	Oxford	500-450	Aulosbläser vor Herme, Schüler
115/6	New York	480-70	2 Aulosbläser Gesangsunterricht
117	Brüssel	475	Aulosbläser Gesangsunterricht
119	Oxford	485	Aulosbläser Rolle Gesangsunterricht ?
120	München	475-50	Aulosbläser Gesangsunterricht Lyra
121	Leyden	475-50	Aulosbläser Gesangsunterricht
X	500-420		
374	Richmond	480	aulos krotala
375	London	500-475	aulos krotala
376	Stanford	470-450	aulos krotala
377	Syracuse	475-450	aulos krotala
378	Basel	500-475	aulos krotala
379	Syracus		aulos Tanz
380	Louvre	450-420	auloi krotala
381	Kopenhagen	450-420	auloi krotala
382	Athen	430	auloi krotala
383	Berlin	430	auloi krotala
391	Boston	450-20	auloi krotala
395	Neapel	450-20	a auloi Tanz b auloi Tanz
397	London	500-475	2 Aulosbläserinnen, drei Männer
400	Petersburg	450-20	2 Frauen mit aulos und Lyra
403	Hamburg	440	2 Frauen mit aulos und Lyra
404	Würzburg	440-30	2 Frauen mit aulos und Lyra